

Designing and evaluating a local model for appointing school principals and selecting teachers (a study among education managers and teachers in Khuzestan province)

Mahta joodzadeh^{1*} 

¹ Corresponding author, Assistant professor department of management institute for Higher education, ACECR ,khuzestan,IR,Iran. E-mail: Mahta_joodzadeh@yahoo.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article type:

Research Article

Article history:

Received: 18 October 2025

Revised: 8 November 2025

Accepted: 7 December 2025

KEYWORDS:

Selection,
Appointment,
Education,
Quality,
Human Resources

ABSTRACT

One of the important measures to actualize the capabilities and potential capacities of human resources is to place people in appropriate positions with their abilities, experiences, and capabilities. Such a view of human resources is called placing the most qualified person in the most appropriate job position. In this regard, teacher selection is very important in advancing the goals of education. Therefore, determining criteria for selecting and hiring educational staff and school management in all countries, including Iran, has a special place that must be specified and updated according to the requirements of the time. The statistical population included all education managers and teachers in Ahvaz, Bavi, and Karun. The research method is a descriptive survey type and, given the importance of the research topic, it was conducted in a mixed (qualitative-quantitative) manner. In the first phase of the research (qualitative), the method of judgmental and snowball sampling was used, with which 16 teachers and expert administrators were interviewed for exploratory purposes. In the second phase (quantitative), 386 teachers and education administrators answered the questionnaire questions using a simple random method using the Krejci and Morgan table. In the first phase, the interview results were analyzed using the directional and summary content analysis method, and in this part, the initial conceptual model of the research was obtained. In this part, 8 concepts and 36 codes for general characteristics and 7 concepts and 45 codes for specialized characteristics were obtained for the selection of teachers and the appointment of administrators. In the second phase, the researcher-made questionnaire was prepared based on the indicators obtained in the first phase, and its results were analyzed using a one-sample t-test. All concepts had a score above 4 (higher than the criterion number -3), and therefore the results showed that the mentioned characteristics are of great importance for the selection and appointment of teachers. In general, managers, as the main decision-maker in dealing with organizational issues and problems, play a decisive role in the success or even failure of the organization. The solution to ensuring the desired appointment is to pay attention to observing the job requirements, evaluating performance, and considering the competencies of managers. A competent manager is someone who has both management knowledge and can make optimal use of experiences. A school principal must, in addition to being a good operational executor, be a credible practical role model, a change culture agent, a talent manager, and a competent planner. The education system, having capable and competent human capital, especially in the field of school management, can have a very significant impact on promoting the quantitative and qualitative goals of the education system.

Introduction

The survival of any organization largely depends on the abilities, skills, awareness, knowledge and various specializations of human resources, especially the managers of that organization. Educational management is the most important, effective and subtle type of management. In education-oriented organizations, such as education, management has a much more important and fundamental role and position, and in a sense, the performance of the organization is more influenced by the performance of its



DOI: <https://doi.org/10.22111/ijop.2025.53592.1064>

© The author(s)

Publisher: University of Sistan and Baluchestan

How to Cite: Joodzadeh, M.(2026). Designing and evaluating a local model for appointing school principals and selecting teachers (a study among education managers and teachers in Khuzestan province). *Iranian Journal of Organizational Psychology*, 3(2), 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.22111/ijop.2025.53592.1064>

managers ([Hosseini & Kohinejad, 2016](#)). One of the important measures to actualize the capabilities and potential capacities of human resources is to place people in appropriate positions with their abilities, experiences and capabilities. Such a view of human resources is called placing the most qualified person in the most suitable job position ([Abbas Pour et al., 2020](#); [Arabi, 2013](#); [Robbins, 2006](#)).

As the main decision-maker in dealing with organizational issues and problems, managers play a decisive role in the success or even failure of the organization ([Shirbegi et al., 2018](#)). The solution to ensuring the desired appointment is to pay attention to meeting the job requirements, evaluating performance, and considering the competencies of managers. A competent manager is someone who has both management knowledge and can make good use of experiences ([Ghasemi et al., 2014](#)). In addition to being a good operational executor, a school principal must also be a credible practical role model, a change culture agent, a talent manager, and a competent planner. The education system, having capable and competent human capital, especially in the field of school management, can have a very significant impact on promoting the quantitative and qualitative goals of the education system ([Abbas Pour et al., 2020](#); [Ferris & Graddy, 2006](#)).

Given that a country's education system plays the most important constructive role, there is a need to discuss and review the country's education system with the day-to-day progress of the educational world. The main axis of an education system is the schools in it, the main pillar of which is educational management. Brandt showed in his research that there is a positive correlation between the effectiveness of managers and the quality of education, in other words, the more competent and capable managers are selected to lead schools, the higher the quality of education will be, and this makes the importance of selecting school managers clearer ([Hosseini & Kohinejad, 2016](#)). The lack of attention paid by education to the role of school managers in creating a healthy, peaceful and cheerful environment for the education and training of students, who are in a way the future builders of this country, is very worrying ([Abbas Pour et al., 2020](#); [Adli & Varkani, 2018](#)). The researcher's experiences and studies conducted on regulations, circulars, and research indicate that the criteria for selecting and appointing principals and teachers have not changed in recent years, and the approved criteria have been implemented very little in practice in the past two decades. The selection and appointment of more than one hundred thousand school principals and more than seven thousand line managers has not been subject to due diligence, which has led to teacher dissatisfaction and, to some extent, to the inefficiency of the education system, which has affected both the people and the government. The results of domestic research also indicate that in order to increase productivity, emphasis can be placed on the methods and criteria for selecting and appointing principals and teachers, and of course, the study of domestic research shows that little research has been conducted on the subject of selecting and appointing principals in the country, and very little work has been done in this field in education ([Piriyayee & Niknami, 2017](#)). And it shows the necessity of paying attention to educational management and investing in training competent managers at the higher, middle and executive levels ([Kabirzadeh et al., 2009](#)). Considering the aforementioned materials and the existing evidence on the gap between the current situation and the desired situation in the field of selecting and appointing managers and teachers in the country and the importance of the issue in this field, the present study seeks to answer the question of what is the indigenous model for appointing school managers and selecting education and training teachers?

Theoretical Framework and Research Background Some experts believe that the term meritocracy was first introduced by the English sociologist Michael Young in (1958) in his book *The Rise of Meritocracy*, who called meritocracy the creative energy of elite and chosen individuals in a society ([Piriyayee, 2015](#)). Since appointment can be considered synonymous with meritocracy, these two words have qualitative overlap. Meritocracy in the Persian dictionary Moein (1996) is synonymous with being deserving, worthy, suitable, and respectful. The Oxford Dictionary (2013) considers meritocracy to be equivalent to a society in which individuals achieve money and status (power) based on their merit and ability ([Piriyayee, 2015](#)). According to Shahar (2015), based on the meritocracy approach, people with equal abilities and competencies usually achieve equal success ([Piriyayee & Niknami, 2017](#)). Vilkinos

(2000) has identified the competencies of senior managers in 55 cases. He has listed task competencies, role, action, skills, abilities and personality traits as the components of competency. Dulewicz (2003) has identified 15 competencies in 3 components in the field of leadership competencies: emotional competencies (motivation, sensitivity, conscientiousness, influence, self-awareness, flexibility and intuition), managerial competencies (resource management, communication, development, empowerment and execution) and intellectual competencies (strategic vision, insight and imagination, judgment and analysis). Zopiatis (2010) also states the competencies required by supervisors as follows: technical, conceptual (ability to innovate, change, and adapt to difficult situations), interpersonal competencies (communication, written, and oral skills, and knowledge of cultural diversity), administrative competencies (budget and strategic planning, understanding of cost management, implementation of labor cost controls, budgeting, strategic planning knowledge, professional administrative ability, time management, organizational skills, and computer skills), management-leadership competencies, leadership ability, decision-making skills, ethical interaction, stability, and emotional control. Booker (2013) also concluded in a study that core managerial competencies are highly related to the performance of managers, but the hierarchy of these competencies is different at different management levels, and listed the core competencies for middle managers as collaboration, strategic thinking, team management, contingent leadership, motivation, and learning in order of priority. Eldanat (2014) expressed the leadership competencies that have a special impact on management in three dimensions: coaching, innovation, and guidance ([Ghasemi et al., 2014](#)). Rezapour (2013) in a study titled "Investigating ways to encourage and attract capable and specialized personnel to obtain managerial positions in the management of education in Kashan" has reached the following results:

1- The four basic variables of the study (authority, job stability, material and spiritual factors, personal issues and problems) more than average encourage and attract capable individuals to managerial positions. 2- There is a significant difference between the opinions of the study subjects (managers and non-manager employees) regarding the ways to encourage and attract capable and specialized individuals, considering their service history and field of study. 3- Based on the results of the ranking, the basic variables for attracting people for management positions are not the same, and the highest ranking is related to the proportion of authority with responsibility, and the lowest is related to personal problems ([Kabirzadeh et al., 2009](#)). Also, in a survey, the principals of high schools and secondary art schools in Tehran were asked what measures should be taken to attract competent and efficient people for the post of high school principal. These individuals have emphasized several issues, the most important of which are:

1- Delegating more authority to managers, 2- Providing favorable conditions for managers to continue their education and complete the necessary courses,

3- Paying appropriate salaries and benefits, especially adequate management rights, 4- Paying attention to managers' suggestions in school-related decision-making, 5- Appreciating their activities and efforts, 6- Stability in management and supporting managers when necessary, 7- Following the established criteria in selecting and appointing managers, 8- Following ethical standards when changing managers ([Kabirzadeh et al., 2009](#)). According to comperferm (2002), competency models can be used as a method for integrating various human resources actions. There are different views on the competency framework. One of these frameworks is the classification of competencies into three categories: knowledge, skills, and personality traits. It is very common to place competencies in these three categories ([Abbas Pour et al., 2020](#); [Jianping & Houcan, 2006](#)). Knowledge in this framework refers to things such as analytical thinking, problem identification and solving, and similar things that relate to intellectual and mental fields. Skills are the ability to apply knowledge in practice. Personality traits also include characteristics such as self-confidence and responsibility. In this framework, there is no distinction between the skill of working with others and task management; therefore, skills such as teamwork, communication with others, and team building are placed alongside competencies such as results orientation and planning ([Abbas Pour et al., 2020](#)).

Management science, as the science of managing organizations, has considered criteria for the competence of individuals, especially when selecting and appointing them to various positions. The main criteria for competence can be listed as follows:

1- Management and supervision skills: A competent manager is one who has the techniques of planning, organizing and coordinating work, the organization's forces and facilities, supervising and directing organizational, group and individual affairs, understanding the situation and applying the appropriate management style, setting precise and specific individual and group goals, following up, examining and controlling important issues and matters, and being aware of the organization's organization, rules and administrative and financial procedures. 2- Decision-making skills: Managers must have the skills of making timely, decisive and accurate decisions, paying attention to the organization's goals and strategies, perspectives and status, and coordinating with other parts of the organization in decision-making, implementing the decisions made quickly and effectively. 3- Creativity and innovation: Creativity is necessary and essential for the survival of any organization. For this reason, a competent person is one who can face new situations and difficult and challenging tasks by presenting creative plans and solutions to solve problems and improve the current situation. 4- Leadership skills: Establishing appropriate communication with others, motivating subordinates towards the organization's goals, approving, encouraging and encouraging good work, guiding, supporting and providing a platform for people to grow, influencing others and gaining their respect for themselves. 5- Technical skills: The ability to use specific knowledge and benefit from various techniques and resources in executive activities. Having technical skills is very important in low-level management due to its supervisory and problem-solving nature.

6- Perceptual skills: Perceptual skills mean the ability to understand organizational complexities, identify key factors and understand their relationship with other factors inside and outside the organization and their role and position in different situations. This skill is very important for obtaining a top management position due to its leadership role. 7- Human skills: Human skills are the skills of establishing clear, open, fair, and non-hateful communication with others, with mutual trust, which is the basis of management.

8- Communication and negotiation skills: Today, negotiation has moved from a discussion of industrial relations to the forefront of a manager's essential skills. Therefore, efforts must be made to understand the opinions and positions of others in order to conduct constructive and effective negotiations inside and outside the organization. 9- Information skills: Managers and competent individuals must have the ability to collect, disseminate, and timely apply relevant and accurate information in matters such as planning, forecasting, and judgment. 10- Computer skills: The ability to use computers to perform tasks and duties is an essential requirement of the new world ([Abbas Pour et al., 2020](#); [Stainer, 1995](#)).

The United Nations has also provided two categories of competencies, which are:

Core competencies include: communication abilities and skills, accountability and responsibility, teamwork, customer orientation, commitment to continuous learning, planning and organization, creativity and technological awareness. 2- Complementary competencies include: leadership, having a vision, empowering others, managing performance, building trust, judgment and decision-making or professional competence is a set of competencies including knowledge, skills and attitudes that are determined to suit each job or profession and are acquired by the individual in educational and experiential processes in educational, work and community environments and are transformed into professional behavior. Competencies have had significant results for selection and appointment, promotion as well as development and educational planning. Managerial competencies can be defined as the knowledge, skills, abilities and sometimes attitudes and tendencies required to manage, lead and direct others; It can also help managers manage people in dynamic and changing service delivery cultures ([Abbas Pour et al., 2020](#)).

The results of Farahani et al (2012) research showed that in the process of recruiting and selecting teachers, attention should be paid to the interest and motivation of the candidates, the physical, psychological and academic abilities and characteristics of the candidates, and the reform and improvement of the recruitment and selection process and the use of local forces. Sadat Hosseini & Kohinejad (2016) research showed that the lack of a professional qualification test for school principals, the lack of priority given to higher academic degrees and degrees (master's and doctoral), and the lack of criteria for activities such as writing or translating books, articles, research, etc., all pave the way for attracting and selecting principals through non-professional and unfair means, including connections, kinship, and political activities, etc., who may lack managerial qualifications. In Japan, there are various criteria for selecting school principals; including having more than 5 years of experience, which in most cases is considered by the Ministry of Education to be more than 10 years or even 20 years. Having academic degrees and advanced degrees related to educational management, and acceptable scientific and educational publications and works; and passing a professional qualification test are among these criteria. On the other hand, the existence of a different management system in Japan, where local boards are present alongside school management, makes the way of managing and directing schools different from all other countries. The existence of a qualification test, theoretical and practical training courses indicate the high sensitivity of the Ministry of Education of this country in the selection and appointment of school principals; this places the educational management staff of Japanese schools at a high level among schools in the world and they are referred to as the best managers and the best management systems. The results of Adali & Verkani (2018) research showed that the conditions for the appointment of school principals do not reflect the importance and complexity of schools as a unit of analysis and the job description defines school principals as observers of the activities of school members, not agents. Therefore, it is necessary to redefine the conditions for the selection and job description of school principals in order to achieve an effective education system. Also, management and leadership training courses should be designed and held for school principals. The results of Piriaei & Niknami (2017) research showed that there is a huge difference between the existing criteria for the appointment and promotion of education principals and the desired criteria from the perspective of teachers and principals, and therefore, teachers and principals differ regarding the existing criteria for the appointment and promotion of principals, but have a relatively similar view regarding the desired criteria. The present study has an innovation in the statistical population and the research method (mixed exploratory).

Method

Research Questions

- 1-What are the general criteria for selecting and appointing line and staff managers in the education of Khuzestan Province?
- 2-What are the general criteria for selecting and appointing teachers in the education of Khuzestan Province?
- 3-What are the specialized criteria for selecting and appointing line and staff managers in the education of Khuzestan Province?
- 4-What are the specialized criteria for selecting and appointing teachers in the education of Khuzestan Province?
- 5-What is the indigenous model for appointing school managers and selecting teachers in the education of Khuzestan Province?

The present study is applied in terms of purpose. Given the importance and sensitivity of the research topic, a mixed exploratory (qualitative and quantitative) method was used. The present study is descriptive in terms of data collection method.

Tools Used

The data collection tools were semi-structured interviews with experts and a researcher-made questionnaire that was extracted from the results of qualitative content analysis of semi-structured interviews. The researcher-made questionnaire was weighted based on the Likert scale of very high, high, medium, low, and very low.

Sample and Sampling Method

The statistical population of the study included all managers and teachers in the city of Ahvaz, and a proportional sample was determined based on the number of members of the statistical population.

Procedure

The research was conducted in two phases. In the first phase, interviews were conducted with expert line and staff managers and experienced teachers in the education of Ahvaz to identify the main variables effective in the selection and appointment of managers and the selection of teachers. The sampling method in this stage was judgmental and snowball. The sample size was also determined based on theoretical saturation in the responses provided, which was determined to be between 15 and 20 people. After the first phase, the collected data were analyzed using qualitative content analysis, and the result was a conceptual model of the research. In this model, 8 concepts and 36 codes for general characteristics and 7 concepts and 45 codes for specialized characteristics were obtained for the selection of teachers and the appointment of managers. In the second phase, a questionnaire extracted from the model and its variables was developed, and given the large statistical population of managers and teachers, according to the Krejci and Morgan sampling table and statistically unlimited, the population was questioned, so 386 managers and teachers were questioned. The sampling method in this stage was cluster. The data obtained from the questionnaire were quantitatively analyzed using SPSS software (descriptive and inferential statistics - one-sample t-test).

Data Analysis

Qualitative Analysis: Content Analysis Method

Content analysis is an exploratory study of real phenomena that seeks to make predictions in which comparisons are made in an unbiased manner ([Berger, 1982](#)). Berelson (1952) defined content analysis as a research method that is used to objectively, systematically, and quantitatively describe the explicit content of communicative messages ([Krippendorff, 2004](#); [Mayring, 2006](#)). Content analysis, also known as discourse analysis, can draw conclusions about non-linguistic issues such as the individual and social characteristics of the speaker or writer and their opinions and tendencies ([Lombard & Synder-Duch, 2003](#)). It also focuses on the characteristics of language as a means of communication to obtain the meaning and content of the text ([Budd & Thorp, 1967](#)). Textual data may be oral or written, open or closed questions, interviews, focus groups, observations, or books and articles ([Kondracki, 2002](#)). Qualitative analysis can also be defined as a controlled, step-by-step methodological approach to the elements under study ([Mayring, 2000](#)). It allows researchers to interpret and interpret the truth of the data subjectively, but in a scientific manner. The objectivity of the results is ensured by the existence of a systematic coding process ([Yanzhang, 2006](#)). Elsewhere, the method of message interpretation is defined by the purposeful and systematic definition of text features ([Stainer, 1995](#)).

Three traditional, guided, and comprehensive approaches have been proposed for the application of content analysis in research. In traditional content analysis, categories are extracted directly from the text of the data. In the guided approach, the basis of the analysis will be existing theories or the results of previous research as initial and guiding codes, and content analysis with a comprehensive approach will begin with counting words and then the context and context of the text will be interpreted ([Graneheim & Lundman, 2004](#)). Considering the above-mentioned classification, in the present study, due to the exploratory nature of the research and the type of subject under study, qualitative content analysis with a guided approach was used. That is, by reviewing the theoretical literature and research background - of course, to the extent that it was related to the subject under study - the theoretical foundations and background related to the selection of teachers and the appointment of principals were used, and then by conducting exploratory interviews in the research field, more factors and variables related to the research topic were collected; then the results of the interviews were qualitatively analyzed and the concepts within them were inferred and classified in the form of comprehensive and barrier codes, concepts and categories.

A scientific study must have a theoretical framework, determine its hypotheses and variables, and seek a suitable method for measuring variables. Sampling: Several members of the statistical population must be selected who have the desired characteristics. Content unit: Words, sentences, editorials, and columns will constitute the content unit. Preparation of analysis categories: In preparing categories, it must be considered that the category is related to the field under study and must have the necessary clarity. Categories must be distinct from each other and each content must ultimately be placed in one of the categories ([Krippendorff, 2004](#); [Robbins, 2006](#)). In a qualitative content analysis with a summary approach, data analysis begins with a search for specific words by manual or computer methods. A large number of words are calculated for each specific term. Here, the researcher wants to know how many times the word in question has been used, directly or indirectly, and by whom, in order to thematize the codes based on them. This allows the researcher to interpret the related themes. Based on this, researchers try to discover the use of the word or the meanings that a word can have ([Eman & Noshadi, 2011](#)).

Table – 1: Basic coding differences in three content analysis approaches

Origin of codes or keywords	Time to recognize passwords or keywords	Start Analysis	Type of content analysis
Codes are derived from data	Codes are determined simultaneously with data analysis	Observation	Traditional content analysis
Codes are derived from theory or research findings	Codes are identified at the same time as or before data analysis	Theory	Targeted content analysis
Keywords are derived based on the researcher's interest or research literature	Keywords are defined before and during data analysis	Keywords	Summary content analysis

Results

After making an appointment and meeting experienced managers and teachers with a background in education, as well as experts (with high levels of education - master's and

doctorates - with valuable experience in the field of education and working with students), a number of people were identified for open and exploratory interviews, and then, based on their familiarity and sufficient insight into their colleagues, the same people guided a number of others to visit the researcher and conduct open interviews with them (using judgment and snowballing in selecting the interviewees). In this way, the researcher arranged the interview schedule after coordinating with them. A total of 16 experts in this section answered the researcher's questions. The criterion for stopping the interviews was theoretical saturation in the responses obtained. The results of the interviews are presented in the form of codes (codes) in Tables 3 and 4.

This table has been compiled based on general and specialized criteria for selecting teachers and managers and based on a combination of codes from open and exploratory interviews, as well as information obtained from theoretical literature and the background.

It should be noted that the interviews with teachers and principals were conducted in a single format because principals are not just experienced teachers who have achieved management positions after years of training, so the number of people interviewed was asked in a combined format (Table 3).

Table – 2: Open-ended interview questions from teachers and education managers in Khuzestan province

Open-ended questions and answers
How do you generally define the criteria for selecting teachers? When it is stated that a teacher should be selected, what criteria come to mind?
To what extent do you think the criteria for selecting teachers are effective in carrying out their duties and responsibilities? What is the situation in your area of responsibility and scope of work? Please give an example
What are the problems you see with selection and its criteria? If possible, please rank them from most to least important
What do you think are the best ways to improve teacher selection? Please list them in order of importance
How do you generally define the criteria for selecting managers? What criteria come to mind when talking about appointing a manager?
What problems do you see in selecting and appointing managers? If possible, please rank them from most to least important
In your opinion, what are the solutions to improve the selection and appointment of managers in education? Please state them in order of importance
Finally, if you have any questions or concerns regarding the selection of teachers or the appointment of education managers that have not been mentioned, please let us know. Final words....

Findings of the qualitative part of the research

In Tables 3 and 4, the results of the qualitative content analysis of the exploratory interviews are presented along with a summary of the information obtained from the theoretical literature and the background of research related to the topic of general and specialized criteria for selecting teachers and appointing education managers in Khuzestan province. The results of this table are the initial model for selecting and appointing education managers and teachers, which later needs to be verified by statistical tests.

Table – 3: Categories and concepts derived from the interviews and the review of theoretical literature and the background about the general criteria for selecting and appointing teachers and managers

Category	Concept	Code
General Criteria	Religious Beliefs	Having faith in God
		Fear of God
		Feeling accountable to God
		Theism

Ethics	Having good manners with students and colleagues Having justice in mind and behavior with others Respect for others Not being selfish and loving others Having a high work conscience Altruism
Effective communication	Having verbal and communication skills Having personal and physical grooming Being sociable and friendly Having mutual understanding
Job attachment	Having creativity and ideation about work matters Having a team spirit Having commitment and responsibility towards students
Personal characteristics	Having a strong and influential personality Having a healthy and normal physical condition
Humility	Having a healthy spirit and mind Being goal-oriented in your job Having a stable personality Intelligence Honesty
A spirit of altruism	Commitment to the land and soil of Iran Concern for the future of the children of this land Patience in dealing with students
Political and social insight	Examining an individual's beliefs and attitudes towards social and public issues Having political insight and attitude
Job skills	Having information and media literacy Motivation among teachers to accept this job Ability to adapt to different moods Having education related to the field being taught Ability to work with new tools and the Internet Up-to-date information and personal capabilities

As can be seen in Table 3, 8 concepts were obtained for the category of general criteria for selecting teachers and appointing education managers in Khuzestan Province. The code for each concept is presented in the third column of Table 3.

Table – 4: Categories and concepts derived from interviews and review of theoretical and historical literature on specialized criteria for selecting and electing teachers and managers

Category	Concept	Code
Professional Criteria	Academic Criteria	Completing teacher training courses
		Successful completion of professional qualification exams
		Successful completion of classroom management skills courses
	Practical skills	Completing up-to-date work-related training workshops
		Ability to work with a computer
Personal Criteria	Personal skills	Ability to manage school and workplace devices and equipment
		Having relevant work knowledge
		Emotional intelligence and ability to deal appropriately with people
		Hard work Critical thinking

	Managing personal stress
	Using the experiences of others
	Effective listening skills
	Speaking ability
	Self-awareness
Job Skills	Intellectual and personal independence
	Ability to resolve work disputes and conflicts
	Having analytical thinking and the ability to solve work problems
	Having a brilliant, relevant and useful work history
Career advancement potential	Providing new solutions in your field of work
	Ability to gain support from superiors
	Leadership spirit
	Attention to continuous evaluations throughout the service period
	Trust building
	Ability to design educational issues
	Attention to continuous learning
	Updating personal knowledge and information
	Having the knowledge to perform the assigned specialized work
	Compliance with laws and regulations
	Obedying superiors
Management skills	Having a letter of encouragement from superiors
	Ability to execute and control
	Ability to coordinate the supervised group
	Ability to plan for subordinates
	Speed in decision-making
	Skill in organizing subordinate forces
	Responsibility for performance
	Time management
	Crisis management
	Skill in converting threats into opportunities
Effective communication skills	Decisiveness in decision-making
	Ability to negotiate and negotiate successfully
	Meeting management skills
	Ability to involve others in appropriate matters
	Ability to use power appropriately

As can be seen in Tables 3 and 4, the general criteria for selecting teachers and appointing school principals in the four regions of education 1, 2, 3, and 4 are presented. The above indicators are based on a summary of information obtained from theoretical literature and research background related to the subject, as well as exploratory interviews with 15 experienced principals and teachers in the city of Ahvaz. The interviews were conducted in such a way that several experienced principals and teachers were initially selected using the judgment method, and then other people were selected for interviews using the snowball method. The questions of the exploratory interviews are presented in Table 2. The criterion used to terminate the interviews was the saturation of the responses (repetition of responses and no new information found in the responses provided). The data from the exploratory interviews, along with the summary of information obtained from theoretical literature and research background, were finally analyzed using directional and summary content analysis. The result was 8 concepts for the category of general criteria for selecting teachers and appointing education managers, including religious beliefs, ethics, effective communication, job attachment, personal characteristics, altruistic spirit, political insight, and job abilities, and 7 concepts for the category of specialized criteria for selecting teachers and

appointing education managers, including scientific criteria, practical skills, personal skills, job skills, career advancement potential, management skills, and effective communication skills.

Quantitative findings

Table – 5: Descriptive statistics of demographic variables

Age	Frequency	Percentage Frequency	Gender	Frequency	Percentage Frequency
20-30 years	26	6/3	Man	109	27/6
31-40 years	99	25/1	Woman	277	70/1
41-50 years	229	58/2	Work Experience	Frequency	Percentage Frequency
61 and above	3	0/8	10 years and less	90	22/8
Education Level	Frequency	Percentage Frequency	11-20 years	122	30/9
Bachelor's Degree	203	51/4	21-30 years	144	36/5
Master's Degree	146	0/37	31-40 years	39	7/3
PhD	37	9/4	Total	386	

As shown in Table 5, the highest frequency of respondents' age is related to the age group of 41-50 years with 229 people with a frequency of 58.2%. In terms of education, most respondents had a bachelor's degree with a frequency of 203 people and a frequency of 51.4%. In terms of gender, most respondents were female with a frequency of 109 people and a frequency of 27.6%. In terms of work experience, the highest work experience is related to the age group of 21-30 years with a frequency of 144 people and a frequency of 36.5%.

A) In this section, it is necessary to examine the general criteria for selecting and appointing teachers and managers. The research questions are as follows:

What are the general criteria for selecting and appointing line and staff managers in the education and training of Khuzestan province?

What are the general criteria for selecting and selecting teachers in the education and training of Khuzestan province?

For this purpose, after reviewing the theoretical literature and research background, conducting exploratory interviews with experts, and analyzing its findings with the help of directional and summary content analysis, the initial research model was presented in the form of two tables for general criteria and another for specialized criteria for the selection and appointment of education managers and teachers (Tables 3 and 4). In this section, each of the obtained components is examined using a one-sample t-test in order to confirm or disprove them statistically. This test is a kind of verification of the same components obtained from the qualitative phase of the research. Components that have an average of above 3 in each section (the number 3 is the criterion number) will remain in the model.

Table – 6: Descriptive statistics of general criteria for the selection and appointment of teachers and managers

Category	Concept	Number	Mean	Standard Deviation
General criteria for selecting and selecting teachers and administrators	Religious beliefs	386	4/50	0/896
	Ethics	386	4/79	0/483
	Effective communication	386	4/66	0/712
	Job affiliation	386	5/03	0/948

Personal characteristics	386	4/69	0/647
Altruism	386	4/80	0/433
Political and social insight	386	4/44	0/885
Job Abilities	386	4/57	0/673
General Criteria	386	4/68	0/435

As can be seen in Table 6, the average of all concepts raised in the general criteria for selecting and electing teachers and administrators is greater than 4 - it has an average above 3 -, meaning that from the experts' point of view, all general criteria for selecting and electing teachers and administrators in the form of the above concepts are important. On the other hand, the small standard deviation of each concept shows that the dispersion of responses regarding their importance is low. That is, there is a good consensus among respondents.

Table – 7: One-sample t-test of general criteria for selecting and electing teachers and administrators

Questions	t	Degrees of freedom	Test value=3			
			Significance level	Difference of means	90% confidence interval	
					Lower limit	Upper limit
Religious beliefs	32/89	385	0/000	1/50	1/41	1/59
Ethics	72/92	385	0/000	1/79	1/74	1/84
Effective communication	45/99	385	0/000	1/66	1/59	1/73
Job commitment	42/15	385	0/000	2/03	1/93	1/12
Personal characteristics	51/37	385	0/000	1/79	1/62	1/75
Altruism	81/68	385	0/000	1/80	1/75	1/84
Political and social outlook	31/98	385	0/000	1/44	1/35	1/53
Job abilities	45/87	385	0/000	1/57	1/50	1/63
General criteria	76/19	385	0/000	1/68	1/64	1/73

As shown in Table 7, the results of inferential statistics and specifically the one-sample t-test related to the general criteria for selecting and electing teachers and administrators are presented. The results show that the significance level of all general criteria for selecting and electing teachers and administrators is less than 0.05, meaning that they have an acceptable significance level. Given that the lower and upper limits are positive for each concept, it can be stated that the mean is greater than the test value (number 3). The difference in the mean compared to the test number for each concept is listed in column five under the heading of the difference in means.

b) In this section, it is necessary to examine the specialized criteria for selecting and electing teachers and administrators. The research questions are as follows:

What are the specialized criteria for selecting and appointing line and staff managers in the education of Khuzestan province?

What are the specialized criteria for selecting and electing teachers in the education of Khuzestan province?

In this section, each of the obtained components is examined using a one-sample t-test in order to confirm or disprove their statistical validity. This test is a kind of verification of the same components obtained from the qualitative phase of the research. Components that have an average of more than 3 in each section (the number 3 is the criterion number) will remain in the model.

Table – 8: Descriptive statistics of specialized criteria for selecting and selecting teachers and administrators

Category	Concept	Number	Mean	Standard Deviation
Specialized criteria for selecting teachers and administrators	Academic criteria	386	4/38	0/712
	Practical skills	386	4/50	0/728
	Personal skills	386	4/47	0/703
	Career skills	386	4/59	0/752
	Career advancement potential	386	4/54	0/665
	Management skills	386	4/77	0/644
	Effective communication skills	386	4/56	0/726
	Specialized criteria (general)	386	4/56	0/648

As can be seen in Table 8, the average of all concepts raised in the specialized criteria for selecting and selecting teachers and administrators is more than 4 - it has an average above 3 -, meaning that from the experts' point of view, all specialized criteria for selecting and selecting teachers and administrators in the form of the above concepts are important. On the other hand, the small standard deviation of each concept shows that the dispersion of responses regarding their importance is low. This means that there is a good consensus among respondents.

Table 9: One-sample t-test of specialized criteria for selecting and selecting teachers and administrators

Questions	t	Degrees of freedom	Test value=3			
			Significance level	Difference of means	95% confidence interval	
					Lower limit	Upper limit
Academic criteria	38/16	385	0/000	1/38	1/31	1/45
Practical skills	40/45	385	0/000	1/50	1/42	1/57
Personal skills	46/92	385	0/000	1/47	1/60	1/74
Career skills	41/77	385	0/000	1/59	1/52	1/67
Career advancement potential	45/63	385	0/000	1/54	1/47	1/61
Management skills	50/88	385	0/000	1/66	1/60	1/73
Effective communication skills	42/42	385	0/000	1/56	1/49	1/64
Specialized criteria (general)	47/40	385	0/000	1/56	1/49	1/62

As shown in Table 9, the results of inferential statistics, and specifically the one-sample t-test, related to the specialized criteria for selecting and selecting teachers and principals are presented. The results show that the significance level of all specialized criteria for selecting and selecting teachers and principals is less than 0.05, meaning that they have an acceptable significance level. Given that the lower and upper limits are positive for each concept, it can be stated that the mean is greater than the test item value (number 3). The difference in the mean relative to the test item number for each concept is listed in column five under the heading of the difference in means.

-Final research model

What is the indigenous model for appointing school principals and selecting teachers in the education of Khuzestan province?

After qualitative and quantitative studies conducted on the research data, the following model was obtained.

Table 10: Final research model

Category	Concepts	Number of concepts	Number of codes for each concept
General criteria	Religious beliefs	8 Concepts	4 code
	Ethics		6 code
	Effective communication		4code
	Job attachment		3code
	Personal characteristics		8code
	Altruistic spirit		3code
	Political and social insight		2code
	Job abilities		6code
	General criteria collection		
Specialized criteria	Academic Criteria	7 Concepts	4 code
	Practical Skills		3 code
	Personal Skills		9 code
	Career Skills		4 code
	Career Advancement		11 code
	Potential		
	Management Skills		10 code
	Effective Communication		4 code
	Skills		
Collection of specialized criteria			45 code

Side Findings

- Ranking of Concepts of Each Criteria in the Selection of Teachers and Appointment of Education Managers

Regarding the identification of general and specialized criteria for the selection of teachers and appointment of education managers by reviewing theoretical literature and research background, and also supplementing them by exploratory interviews with expert teachers and managers in education in Khuzestan province, this section will rank each of the concepts to determine which ones are more important. For this purpose, the Friedman test is used. Its results are presented in Table 11.

Table 11: Ranking of General and Specialized Criteria for the Selection of Teachers and Appointment of Managers

Concepts	Mean of each concept	Number	Chi-Square	Degrees of freedom	Significance level
Religious beliefs	9/51	386	931/674	16	0/000
Ethics	11/40	386	931/674	16	0/000
Effective communication	10/00	386	931/674	16	0/000
Job commitment	11/57	386	931/674	16	0/000
Personal characteristics	9/91	386	931/674	16	0/000
Altruism	12/06	386	931/674	16	0/000
Political and social outlook	8/23	386	931/674	16	0/000
Job abilities	7/66	386	931/674	16	0/000
General criteria	7/91	386	931/674	16	0/000
Academic criteria	6/98	386	931/674	16	0/000
Practical skills	8/38	386	931/674	16	0/000
Personal skills	9/63	386	931/674	16	0/000

Career skills	9/01	386	931/674	16	0/000
Career advancement potential	6/55	386	931/674	16	0/000
Management skills	9/97	386	931/674	16	0/000
Effective communication skills	8/09	386	931/674	16	0/000
Specialized criteria (general)	6/16	386	931/674	16	0/000

As the results of the Friedman test in Table 11 show, the significance level of the test for each concept is 0.000, and considering that it is less than 0.005, the test has acceptable significance. This means that the ranking of concepts is different from each other and therefore each concept has a specific average (rank). Among the general criteria, the spirit of altruism has the highest average (rank), so it is most important in the opinion of the respondents, then job attachment and then ethics are at the highest level of rank and importance. The lowest rank of the general criteria is related to job abilities and then political and social insight of teachers and managers. Among the specialized criteria, the highest average (rank) and therefore importance is related to the concept of management skills and then personal skills. The lowest rank and importance among the specialized criteria for selecting teachers and appointing managers are related to the concepts of career advancement potential and scientific criteria of teachers and education managers. According to the respondents, among the general and specialized criteria for selecting teachers and appointing education managers, general criteria with an average of 91.7 are more important than specialized criteria for selecting teachers and appointing education managers with an average of 16.6.

Discussion

The present research project entitled Providing an Optimal Model for Selecting and Appointing School Managers and Selecting Teachers in Order to Provide Quality to the Human Resources was carried out under the support of the General Directorate of Education of Khuzestan Province. The project implementer was the Khuzestan Academic Jihad.

In this project, after a complete and comprehensive review of the research literature and background related to the research topic in a library manner, the project implementer reached relevant theories as well as points about the criteria for selecting and appointing managers and selecting teachers in education. Then, to complete the information, open and exploratory interviews were conducted with experts in this field. The method of selecting people for interviews in this section was judgmental and snowball. A total of 16 experts in this section answered the researcher's questions. The criterion for stopping the interviews was theoretical saturation in the responses obtained. In this context, open-ended questions were asked of experts about the existence of criteria for selecting and appointing managers and teachers in education. The results obtained were analyzed in the form of qualitative content analysis of a directional and summary type. The results were categorized into concepts in the form of general criteria (8 concepts and 36 codes. The concepts included religious beliefs (having faith in God, fear of God, feeling accountable to God, belief in God), ethics (having good ethics with students and colleagues, having Justice in mind and behavior towards others, respect for others, not being selfish and loving others, having a high work conscience, altruism), effective communication (having verbal and communication skills, having personal and external grooming, being sociable and philanthropic, having mutual understanding), job attachment (having creativity and ideation about work matters, having a team spirit, having commitment and responsibility towards students), personal characteristics (having creativity and ideation about work matters, having a team spirit, having commitment and responsibility towards students, humility and humility, having a strong and influential personality, having healthy and normal physical conditions, having a healthy spirit and mind, being goal-oriented in one's job, having personality stability, intelligence, honesty), altruism (commitment to the land and soil of Iran, having concern for the future of the children of this border and land, having patience and patience in dealing with students), political and social insight (examining the individual's opinion and attitude towards social and public issues, having

political insight and attitude) and job abilities (having information and media literacy, being motivated in To accept this job, teachers must have the ability to adapt to different moods, have education related to the field being taught, be able to work with new tools and the Internet, be up-to-date with information and personal capabilities) and professional criteria (7 concepts and 45 codes. Concepts include scientific criteria (complete teacher training courses, pass specialized qualification exams, successfully pass classroom management skill courses, pass up-to-date training workshops related to the job), practical skills (ability to work with a computer, ability to manage school and workplace devices and equipment, have relevant work knowledge), personal skills (emotional intelligence and ability to deal appropriately with people, hard work, have critical thinking, use the experiences of others, effective listening skills, speaking ability, self-awareness, intellectual and personality independence), job skills (ability to resolve work disputes and conflicts, have analytical thinking and the ability to solve work problems, have a brilliant, relevant and useful work history, provide new solutions in one's field of work), career advancement potential (ability to attract support from higher-ups, have a leadership spirit, pay attention to continuous assessments throughout the course) Service, trust-building, ability to design educational issues, attention to continuous learning, updating personal knowledge and information, having knowledge to perform assigned specialized work, observing laws and regulations, obeying superiors, having a letter of encouragement from superiors), management skills (ability to implement and control, ability to coordinate the supervised group, ability to plan for subordinates, speed in decision-making, skill in organizing subordinate forces, accountability for performance, time management, crisis management, skill in converting threats into opportunities, decisiveness in decision-making) and effective communication skills (ability to successfully negotiate and negotiate, skill in managing meetings, ability to involve others in appropriate matters, ability to use power appropriately) were identified as effective in the selection, election and appointment of teachers and education managers.

The initial research model was then distributed in the form of a researcher-made questionnaire among 386 teachers and education managers in all four districts of Ahvaz, Karun and Bavi. The results of this section showed that all the concepts classified in the general and specialized criteria section were approved by a large number of teachers and education managers. The average obtained for each concept in this section was more than the criterion number 3. Therefore, each of the concepts was of great importance in the selection, election, and appointment of teachers and managers (more than the number 4).

The results of the ranking of concepts in each section showed that among the general criteria, the spirit of altruism has the highest average (rank), so it is most important in the opinion of the respondents, then job affiliation and then ethics are at the highest level of rank and importance. The lowest rank of the general criteria is related to job abilities and then political and social insight of teachers and managers.

Among the specialized criteria, the highest average (rank) and therefore importance is related to the concept of management skills and then personal skills. The lowest rank and importance among the specialized criteria for selecting teachers and appointing managers is related to the concepts of career advancement potential and scientific criteria for teachers and education managers.

According to the respondents, among the general and specialized criteria for selecting teachers and appointing education managers, general criteria are more important than specialized criteria for selecting teachers and appointing education managers.

In line with the results obtained, it is recommended to education managers that:

- When selecting and hiring teachers, they should pay attention to their relevant work experience.
- Use the successful experience of other countries in hiring and selecting teachers and appointing administrators.
- Age should also be considered in hiring and appointing (older ages to benefit from a broader perspective and greater impact).
- Religious beliefs of individuals should be considered in selecting and appointing (including faith in God, fear of God, feeling accountable to God, belief in God).
- Ethics should be considered in selecting and appointing (including having good morals with students and colleagues, having justice in mind and dealing with others, respecting others, not being selfish and loving others, having a high work conscience, altruism).

-Effective communications should be considered in selecting and appointing (including having verbal and communication skills, having external and personal cleanliness, being sociable and philanthropic, having mutual understanding).

-Job relevance in selection and appointment (including creativity and ideation about work matters, teamwork spirit, commitment and responsibility towards students) should be considered.

-Personal characteristics in selection and appointment (including creativity and ideation about work matters, teamwork spirit, commitment and responsibility towards students, humility and humility, strong and influential personality, healthy and normal physical condition, healthy spirit and mind, goal-oriented in one's job, personality stability, intelligence, honesty) should be considered.

-Altruism in selection and appointment (including commitment to the land and soil of Iran, concern for the future of the children of this border and land, patience and patience in dealing with students) should be considered.

-Political and social insight in selection and appointment (including examining the individual's opinion and attitude towards social and public issues, political insight and attitude) should be considered.

-Career skills in selection and appointment (including information and media literacy, teachers' motivation to accept this job, ability to adapt to different moods, education related to the field being taught, ability to work with new tools and the Internet, up-to-date information and personal capabilities) should be considered.

-Scientific criteria in selection and appointment (including completing teacher training courses, passing specialized qualification exams, successfully completing classroom management skills courses, and attending up-to-date work-related training workshops) should be considered.

-Practical skills in selection and appointment (including computer skills, ability to manage school and workplace devices and equipment, and having relevant work knowledge) should be considered.

-Personal skills in selection and appointment (including emotional intelligence and the ability to deal appropriately with people, hard work, critical thinking, using the experiences of others, effective listening skills, speaking ability, self-awareness, intellectual and personality independence) should be considered.

-Career skills in selection and appointment (including the ability to resolve work disputes and conflicts, having analytical thinking and the ability to solve work problems, having a brilliant, relevant and useful work history, providing new solutions in one's field of work) should be considered.

-Career advancement potential in selection and appointment (including the ability to attract support from superiors, having a leadership spirit, paying attention to continuous assessments during the service period, building trust, the ability to design educational issues, paying attention to continuous learning, updating personal knowledge and information, having knowledge of performing the assigned specialized work, observing laws and regulations, obeying superiors, having a letter of encouragement from superiors) should be considered.

-Management skills in selection and appointment (including the ability to execute and control, the ability to coordinate the supervised group, the ability to plan for subordinates, speed in decision-making, skill in organizing subordinate forces, accountability for performance, time management, crisis management, skill in turning threats into opportunities, decisiveness in decision-making) should be considered.

- Effective communication skills should be considered in selection and appointment (including the ability to successfully negotiate and negotiate, meeting management skills, the ability to involve others in appropriate matters, and the ability to use power appropriately).

Acknowledgements

We extend our heartfelt thanks to all staff members at the University of Sistan and Baluchestan in Iran and Delhi University in India for their involvement in this research endeavor.

References

Iman M., T., & Noshadi M. R.. (2011). qualitative content analysis.Research. *Journal, third year, second issue*, pp. 15-44[in Persian].

- Piriaei, H., & Niknami, M. (2017). Presenting a model for improving the system of appointment and promotion of education managers. *management and planning in educational systems*, period 10, number 1 (series 18), pp. 9-28 [in Persian].
- Piriaei, H. (201^o). Criteria for the appointment of education managers. *the second international conference on modern researches in management*, economics and humanities, United Arab Emirates, [in Persian].
- Hosseini, M. S., & Kohinejad, A. (2016). A comparative study of the selection and appointment of school principals in the educational systems of Iran and Japan. *International Conference on Humanities and Behavioral Sciences*, September 2016, pp. 1-17 [in Persian].
- Shirbaghi, N., Gholami, K., & Ahmadi, H. (2018). Qualitative and quantitative analysis of experiences and feedback of participants in employment interviews in education and training. *Journal of Educational Sciences of Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz*, 6th period, year 25, number 1, pp. 23-42 [in Persian].
- Kabirzadeh N., M., Saadatmand, Z., & Rajaipour, S. (2009). Factors affecting the recruitment of capable education and training personnel in school management positions from the point of view of principals. assistants and teachers of elementary schools in Najaf Abad city, *Educational Leadership and Management Quarterly*, Islamic Azad University, Garmsar branch, third year, number 3, pp. 125-143 [in Persian].
- Abbaspour, A., Khorsandi Taskouh, A., Khosravi, M., Tagvi Fard, M. T., & Azimi Moghadam, H. (2020). Designing the Competency Model of Secondary School Principals. *School Management Scientific Quarterly*, Volume 8 - Issue 2, pp. 246-278 [in Persian].
- Adli, F., & Melabi Verkani, A. (2018). School principals' understanding of the nature and function of their professions. *two scientific quarterly journals of school management*, 6th volume - 2nd issue, pp. 19-39 [in Persian].
- Farahani, A., Nasrasafhani, A., & Sharif, S. M. (2012). Evaluation of primary teacher selection methods in the country's education system. *scientific-research journal of education technology*, 7th year, volume 7, pp. 1-12 [in Persian].
- Ghasemi, H., Henry, H., Rezaei Sufi, M., & Momenifar, F. (2014). Designing a model of core competencies for the appointment of middle managers of the Ministries of Sports and Youth. *Strategic Studies of Sports and Youth*, pp. 2014-1-25 [in Persian].
- Adli, F., & Varkani, A. M. (2018). School Principals Understand the Nature and Function of Their Professional and Professional. *School Management*, 6(2), 19-39 [in Persian].
- Aarabi. (2013). Tehran: Cultural Research Office, 16th edition [in Persian].
- Berger AA. (1982) Media Analysis Techniques. Newberry Park: Sage, 107-110.
- Budd, R. W., R. K. Thorp, L. D., (1967). Content analysis of Communications; K. Lindkvist, "Approaches to textual analysis", *Advances in content analysis*, eds: K. E. Rosengren, p.23-41.
- Ferris, J. M., & Graddy, E. A. (2006). Why do nonprofits merge, *unpublished manuscript*, Los Angeles, CA.
- Graneheim UH, & Lundman B. (2004). Qualitative content analysis in nursing research: concepts, procedures and measures to achieve trustworthiness. *Nurs Edu Today*, 24: 105–112.
- Gilliland, S. W., & Steiner, D. D. (2012). Applicant reactions to testing and selection. In N. Schmitt (Ed.), *The Oxford handbook of personnel assessment and selection* (pp. 629–666 Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Jianping, X., & Houcan, Z. (2006). Competency Model of Primary and Secondary School Teachers: A Study of Behavioral Event Interviews [J]. *Educational Research*, 1(011).
- Kondracki, N. L., & Wellman N. S., (2002). Contentanalysis: Review of methods and their applications in nutrition education, *Journal of Nutrition Education and Behavior*, vol 34, p. 224-230.

- Krippendorff K., (2004). Content analysis: an introduction to its methodology, *Translated by Nayebi H. Tehran*: Ney; 9-11.
- Lombard M., Synder-Duch J., & Bracken CC.,(2003). Content analysis in mass communication: assessment and reporting of intercoder reliability. *Human Commun Res*, 29: 469-472.
- Mayring P.,(2006). Qualitative Content Analysis. Available from: <http://qualitative-research.net/fqs-e/2-00inhalt-e.htm>. [about 15p.]. Accessed on: 10 June .
- Mayring , P. , (2000). Qualitative content analysis. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 1(2).
- Robbins, S. (2006). Organizational Behavior (Concepts, Theories, Applications). *Translated by Ali Parsaiyan and Seyed Mohammad*.
- Robinson L, (2006). Why content analysis should be used more in Library and Information Studies research. *Library Stud J*; 9: 1-4.
- Stainer, A. (1995). Productivity management: the Japanese experience, *The journal of Management Decision*, Vol. 33 Iss 8, pp 12-4
- Taheri, S., Farrokhi, N. A., Borjali, A., & Abbaspour, A. (2017). Explaining the role of individual and organizational components of employees in order to develop a model for promotion and appointment to middle management with emphasis on competency (Case study: National Iranian Oil Company). *Educational Measurement Quarterly*, 7(27), 21-43 [in Persian].
- Yanzhang. ,(2006) Content analsis (qualitative, thematic) in: <http://www.ils.unc>.